The James Memorial Library in Williston, designed by R.S. Frost. The library was given in tribute to Daniel Willis James at the suggestion of James' close friend and associate, James J. Hill. Hill himself had earlier made a lavish gift in the donation of a Minneapolis library.
"A Mighty Influence"
Library Philanthropy in North Dakota
During the Carnegie Era

Lauren L. McCroskey

Proclaiming libraries and book reading as the "cure for evils," the 1923 opening address for the Leach Public Library in Wahpeton fervently endorsed the new library as "a mighty influence in the development of good characters and intelligence on the part of our citizens." Such reform-minded rhetoric reflected the influence of a nationwide library movement that began around 1885, when progressive thinkers vigorously promoted the social and cultural benefits of public libraries. Library philanthropists, including Andrew Carnegie and others, were champions of the library movement, building personal memorials in the form of architectural tributes to Surviving works of these benefactors remain some of the more visible buildings in their communities. Most continue to serve as promised upon their founding, offering a democratic opportunity for educational and cultural refinement to all residents.

Nationally, the library movement dated from colonial times, but it was not until the middle of the nineteenth century that the public library movement became a national passion, stimulated by advancements in printing methods and a marked increase in leisure reading. Progressive politics and a renewed commitment to the democratic necessity of available reading materials were also significant influences. Most importantly, the coffers for library development were enriched by America's industrial growth. With the dividends of industrial wealth and a rising community tax base, promoters found new monies for library projects. Carnegie and other philanthropists gave essential financial support to this movement, particularly between 1885 and 1905, when the majority of philanthropic library buildings were constructed.

In North Dakota, the library movement was widely known through books, journals and newspapers. A free library law enacted by the Territorial Legislature of 1887 had provided the opportunity for small towns and communities in the Dakotas to secure tax measures to support library service. Nonetheless, the rural character of the state limited funding opportunities and made library establishment difficult in other than the major communities. The North Dakota Public Library Commission was created by the Legislature in 1907 as a partial remedy to combat the rural void in public reading materials and to encourage library establishment. A system of traveling libraries was developed by the Commission, designed to reach rural communities that might never obtain a library facility. In many larger communities the library movement gained momentum from the vision of a local volunteer group or literary society. When North Dakota received its first Carnegie grant — for the Fargo Library, opened in 1903 — the state had five public libraries in place and one of philanthropic origin in Mayville almost completed.

North Dakota's Carnegie Libraries

Library philanthropy in this country peaked in a late Victorian climate of powerful industrial empires and emerging social reforms that marked the early years of twentieth century America. With the spoils of free enterprise, steel baron Andrew Carnegie bequeathed a fortune to the cause of social progress, creating a standard for library philanthropy that has not been repeated.

1 "Public Library Will Be Badge of Honor to City," Wahpeton Globe, June 22, 1923.
4 Ibid., p. 118.
Local philanthropists had donated public libraries even before the height of the library movement, but their gifts were at times thrust upon communities, and, therefore, were not always an expression of popular need. Conversely, Carnegie's Library Program, with headquarters in New York, was largely disengaged from the far-flung communities seeking Corporation funding, and granted requests only by formal application. Awards were based upon a community's successful identification of a legitimate need for a library. The Carnegie Library Program left an indelible mark of 2,509 free public libraries constructed throughout the world. From its American debut in 1881 to its end in 1917, the impact of the Program was felt with the construction of a library in every state except Rhode Island.

The story of Andrew Carnegie is part of the lore of industrial history and free enterprise in America. He eventually acquired one of the largest fortunes in the history of this country, the wealth and leisure of which allowed him to participate in one of the great social pastimes of the wealthy, philanthropy. Although he held reading and education in the highest regard and was himself an avid reader, journalist and scholar, much criticism has been given to the motive of Carnegie's philanthropy. Some claim it was his attempt to assuage a gnawing guilt for ill-gotten wealth, while others insist he was motivated by purely humanitarian forces. Perhaps it was Carnegie's favorite boyhood retreat at the personal library of a local patron that later prompted him to chart a formalized program of library philanthropy targeted at the United States and all English-speaking countries. Still, the former claim may be more credible in view of a statement he once made, "the amassing of wealth is one of the worst species of idolatry." Carnegie's gifts were, at the very least, shrewd investments. His one-time cash outlay yielded an enor-


mous return — communities provided a piece of real estate and guaranteed long term curation of his memorials with a yearly maintenance pledge.

The Library Program, administered by Carnegie’s close aid, personal secretary and fellow Scotsman James Bertram, made hundreds of gifts in its first year of operation. The Program was principally intended for building endowments, although books, furniture and paintings were also granted. Bertram was responsible for the dispersing of the library funds, conducted all correspondence with applicants and acted as a buffer between Carnegie and a persistent public. Decisions to grant awards were largely his own, and increasingly he played a major role in architectural design review. Both Bertram and Carnegie had a frugal and practical approach to library design and often penned critical replies such as “too many pillars” to potential grantees.8

Communities wishing to receive Carnegie grants were asked to fill out a “Schedule of Questions.” Required information included the community size and the floor space, circulation figures and numbers of volumes in existing libraries. The size of the gift was gauged by popular factors, the current growth rate of a community and an overall assessment of local needs.9 Since swelling populations usually meant a greater need for cultural facilities such as libraries, opera houses and universities, fast growing towns were the best candidates for Carnegie support. The social goals of the Carnegie Program were largely based on a general humanitarian philosophy. Carnegie declined to award grants to private universities or subscription libraries buttressed by other donations. He felt that his gifts should not be made to privileged organizations and those persons already enlightened about the value of books.10

Somewhat typical of the pattern of Carnegie library funding, the Grand Forks (Carnegie) Library had its origins with a group of women organizing the “Grand Forks Library Association” in 1895, an effort that was followed by the appointment of a Board of Library Directors in 1900. Still without an actual facility, the board engaged the local chapter of the Odd Fellows for use of their meeting hall. The following year, convinced that the city should secure a library building of its own, the Board began a plea for donations from the Carnegie Corporation. The reply was a sum of $20,000, the only stipulations being that the city furnish a site for the building and make an annual appropriation for maintenance.11 This scenario was repeated with only slight variation in many attempts to establish a public library.

North Dakota received eleven Carnegie grants, including eight public gifts and three college endowments. Thirteen Carnegie applications were originally submitted by North Dakota communities; of these, two were unsuccessful in securing funds.12 Both Mandan and Bottineau made applications; while the Mandan grant is known to have foundered over a local dispute involving the building location, details about Bottineau’s failed attempt are unknown.13 The reasons for failure are not easy to pinpoint, although in most cases Carnegie gifts were denied because the city commission would not meet the annual 10 percent support pledge required by the Corporation.14 Siting problems were also common, but in only a few cases were projects turned down for architectural reasons. Neither Carnegie or Bertram looked favorably upon ambitious designs or architectural flourishes, and consequently, a few designs were dismissed as impractical or extravagant.

For the most part, building dates for Carnegies across the state reflect the east-to-west march of the frontier. Generally, they reflect the Carnegie pattern of giving more generous endowments to larger communities and smaller gifts to less populated areas.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Location</th>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Amount</th>
<th>Status</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Fargo</td>
<td>1901</td>
<td>$20,000</td>
<td>Razed</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Grand Forks</td>
<td>1901</td>
<td>$22,000</td>
<td>Razed</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Valley City</td>
<td>1901</td>
<td>$15,000</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Grafton</td>
<td>1903</td>
<td>$10,000</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>N.D.S.U., Fargo</td>
<td>1905</td>
<td>$18,400</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Minot</td>
<td>1908</td>
<td>$15,000</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Devils Lake</td>
<td>1908</td>
<td>$12,500</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dickinson</td>
<td>1908</td>
<td>$12,500</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>U.N.D., Grand Forks</td>
<td>1909</td>
<td>$30,000</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fargo College</td>
<td>1910</td>
<td>unknown</td>
<td>Razed</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bismarck</td>
<td>1916</td>
<td>$25,000</td>
<td>Razed</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

With the leveling off of the population after the Second Dakota Boom, there was a concurrent decline in Carnegie gifts, as the state no longer met Carnegie’s

10 Ibid.
12 Brudvig, p. 61.
14 Barend H. Kroze, A Prairie Saga (Saint Paul, Minnesota: North Central Company, 1952), p. 70. The history of the Jamestown College library recounts an episode in which college president Barend Kroze made a personal visit to Carnegie’s home in New York to request money and was promised a sum of $25,000 by Corporation secretary, Bertram. That this library is absent from official records of the Corporation’s gifts suggests that funds were later revoked. Nonetheless, the Jamestown College library was built from a contribution made by the library’s namesake, wealthy Philadelphian, Mary Thaw.
criteria for expanding population. World War I further halted the erection of libraries funded during the final year of the Carnegie program in 1917. As communities adjusted their priorities to meet the pressures of a wartime economy, many grants were suspended and communities often did not reclaim their grants.

In spite of similarities in population and geographic isolation, North Dakota received far less Carnegie support than the neighboring states of South Dakota, Montana, and Minnesota. Compared to North Dakota’s eleven, South Dakota received twenty-five library grants, Montana seventeen and Minnesota fifty-five. Carnegie awards in North Dakota were usually above $15,000, while South Dakota received many smaller grants in the range of $5,000-$10,000, suggesting that the library movement was stronger in that state’s smaller communities. The Carnegie Program offered the opportunity to further bulwark even modest community resources for library development. But the convenience of North Dakota’s traveling libraries may have diminished the urgency of acquiring an actual library building for many of the state’s smaller towns.

Mr. Carnegie placed few covenants on the use of his money for libraries, aside from his cautions against "wasteful" window placement, and an insistence that rooms incorporate natural light and feature maximum book storage. His major concern was that the design of libraries be functional. While there were few constraints on the size and style of Carnegie libraries, the Corporation did, after 1908, require communities to send their designs and specifications in for review and approval. Carnegie’s secretary, Bertram, developed a pamphlet, "Notes on Library Architecture," which voiced concern about frivolous architecture and wasted space. Adherence to these notes was not mandatory, but the booklet did much to standardize library design after 1908. Still, designs were rarely turned down unless they were too outlandish and strayed from the Carnegie precepts of well-lit spaces with maximum book storage. The selection of an architect was left to the local community.

In the later years of Carnegie endowments there was some encouragement of simple, functional buildings of unpretentious design. In addition, there were a number of plan types available from the Corporation, although nothing to constitute a pattern book approach. Design standardization was not encouraged but seems to have occurred regardless. The Corporation’s file of successful

Minot Carnegie Library (above) and Stillwater, Wisconsin public library (left). North Dakota Carnegies rarely strayed from standard Neoclassical programs such as R.S. Frost’s design for the Minot Carnegie Library. This library, built in 1909, seems to be the companion to the Stillwater, Wisconsin public library of 1907, designed by the renowned Midwest firm of Claude and Stark.

---

15 Brudvig, p. 61.

16 Bauman, p. 38.
Carnegies sited on corner lots such as the Fargo Carnegie Library (now demolished) often made use of the radial plan, suggested by a semicircular projection (left facade) which contained stacks in a radial arrangement. With stacks converging at one point, librarians were better able to monitor patrons and check books.

Building designs and architects was made available to local library commissions. Smaller communities, more comfortable with precedent than with experimentation, often chose a particular design that had been built elsewhere and hired a local architect to duplicate it in their town. The similarity of the state's Carnegies to libraries found in other parts of the country suggests that this process prevailed in North Dakota. Several of North Dakota's libraries were probably inspired by existing libraries outside the state.

Although, nationally, the exuberance of the Carnegie Library Program is most strongly felt in the great Classical Revival subjects found in New York, Pittsburgh and Philadelphia, the character of Carnegie libraries across the country is diverse. The inventory includes Mission-style libraries in southern California and Prairie School designs in small midwestern towns. Still, the bulk of Carnegies are Neoclassical expressions bearing temple-like entries, classical columns and symmetry of form. The classical image of libraries was hard to dislodge, having been sanctified in this country by such works as Thomas Jefferson's Library Rotunda at the University of Virginia. Almost a century later, the architectural language of political liberty retrieved from ancient Greece had been translated into symbols of cultural endurance and civic prosperity.

The Corporation's liberal attitude toward design, verified by a rich array of styles nationwide, is not in evidence in North Dakota. Here, Neoclassicism gives way only in the less conventional designs used in non-Carnegie endowments. Despite the relative conformity of exterior designs, interiors of North Dakota Carnegies are often more reflective of individual community needs. For example, the 1903 Grafton Carnegie Library's Board combined public library operations with the high school library system. The Grafton Carnegie also became the state's first public library to house a separate children's book collection.17

In the Grand Forks Carnegie Library, interior design and functional components were developed by the library board, who then engaged Warren H. Milner of Chicago to draft the plans and prominent Grand Forks architect Joseph Bell de Remer to supervise the project. The finished library design provided local patrons with a 250-seat basement auditorium, as well as a library proper with lobby area, children's room, reference room, reading room, stack and office.18 These rooms played a pivotal role in the cultural life of the community and often served dual functions — the auditorium as the scene of musical events and Victrola concerts as well as lectures, the reading room as both museum and art gallery, depending on the occasion.

An innovative design found in some Carnegies was that of the radial plan. The Fargo Carnegie, now razed, was sited on a corner lot; its location made it well suited for development of a library interior with a semicircular bay projecting from one corner. The half round bay reflected the interior arrangement of stacks into a radial configuration that converged at a central circulation desk. Partly aesthetic, the plan eased viewing and monitoring of the stacks by the librarian, but also proved economical since only one librarian was required to monitor the stacks and check books.19

Second Avenue North was considered an unfortunate location since it gave little opportunity for a grand entry or ornamentation. Attitudes surrounding the building's plan and ornamentation are revealed in an excerpt from the North Dakota Public Library Commission's report that states, "on account of the lack of opportunity for exterior adornment, efforts were made to make the interior as rich and pleasant as was possible with the money at hand."  

Regardless of the stylistic license allowed by the Corporation, North Dakota Carnegies mirrored the national vogue for the Neoclassical style of public architecture. Clean volumes with sparse ornamentation, they display only rare embellishments such as the temple front of the Valley City Carnegie Library. Ironically, the design of this library echoes a complaint of Corporation secretary James Bertram that, "a frequent cause of waste is the attempt to get a Greek temple...with a $40,000 appropriation."  

**Other Philanthropic Libraries**

Local library endowments unrelated to the Carnegie Program are represented by seven well-known examples in the North Dakota towns of Jamestown, Williston, Leonard, Wahpeton, Lakota, Bowman and Mayville. While both Carnegie and non-Carnegie projects had in common the broader goals of social and educational reform, they often differed significantly in the scenarios and conditions under which donations were made. Locally based philanthropies reveal sometimes subtle influences of local and regional politics and social propriety that have influenced library donations.

Contrary to national trends, North Dakota's first library philanthropy was financed with agrarian wealth from the Red River Valley, rather than with eastern industrial profits. In Mayville, the establishment of a privately endowed library followed railroad expansion and the Second Dakota Boom. After the Northern Pacific bankruptcy in 1873, the company's reorganizers allowed stockholders J.L. and E.B. Grandin to exchange their devalued securities for railroad acreage. Pennsylvania natives with only passing interest in North Dakota, the Grandin brothers parlayed their bonds into a Bonanza wheat growing operation in the Red River Valley; in time, a stock farm in Mayville became headquarters for their vast holdings that extended into southeastern Traill County. The Grandins were no doubt aware of the need for alternative sources of recreation and entertainment in a town frequented by seasonal employees of their Bonanza farm. Until the library was built in 1900, their field hands' recreational pursuits were confined to poolhalls and the taverns of Moorhead or East Grand Forks. As an example of philanthropy designed to cure social ills, it can only be speculated whether the public library did much to temper the colorful social life of Bonanza farm workers. But as a boost to the cultural offerings of a community, libraries and other cultural buildings were always viewed as inducements for new and desirable population growth. With their farming venture, the Grandins and others like them channeled...
wealth and culture into still sparsely settled railroad lands.

Motives for local philanthropy were also prone to personal agendas or social pressures. For example, when a prominent political or business leader, having themselves made a library endowment, encouraged a friend or ally to make a similar donation in their community, a "chain of philanthropy" resulted. The "chain of philanthropy" is illustrated in the history of the James Memorial Library, built in Williston in 1911. This endowment was first suggested by Great Northern Railway magnate James J. Hill as a tribute to his friend and former associate, Daniel Willis James. Hill himself had earlier made a lavish donation to the Minneapolis library that bears his name. At Hill's urging, Arthur Curtiss James agreed to build the library in memory of his father. Such gifts were perhaps less representative of philanthropic gestures than they were of personal causes and efforts to maintain prudent socio-political ties.

The establishment of the James Memorial Library is also an instance in which a private bequest took over a library project after an application was turned down by the Carnegie Corporation. When the Corporation denied a library request, communities often appealed to a local philanthropist to provide a building; commonly, a local endowment would succeed a failed attempt to secure a Carnegie grant. Carnegie hoped that by denying monies, wealthy patrons would come forward with their own gift. He justified such decisions as a part of his goal to target truly needy communities that lacked potential benefactors.

The Alfred Dickey Library in Jamestown was funded with profits from large speculative land holdings in the James River Valley. Built in 1917 and donated by the state's first Lieutenant Governor Alfred M. Dickey and his son, the building was not actually completed until after the deaths of both sponsors. The library, designed by the local firm of Shannon and Scherer, was an architectural revolution for North Dakota and has remained one of the state's best examples of the Prairie School movement that was gaining force in the upper Midwest. The library's design cast off classical precedents in favor of organic motifs and other natural elements that are hallmarks of the Prairie School. Simple in form and mass, it preserves the symmetry of classical buildings while using foliate terra cotta ornamentation in window surrounds, capitals and planters. Most unusual is the Egyptian interior of battered piers and lotus style capitals rendered in wood.

Far removed from this example is the Victorian folk cottage design of the Watts Free Library in Leonard. Like other library patrons throughout the state, benefactor Edgerton Watts made his donation for the future benefit and educational welfare of the surrounding community. Watts was not moved to make his library gift because of surplus wealth or because of political or social pleasure, but rather by humanistic values based on visible needs in his community. Lacking the wealth of his

Many Carnegies used a Classical program of columns, frieze details, panelled woodwork and statuary to achieve an atmosphere of cultural refinement. Pictured is the Valley City Carnegie Library designed by William Albrandt. Carnegie's philosophy encouraged functional library design and eschewed frivolous architecture. Embellishments such as the temple front prompted Secretary Bertram to complain that, "a frequent cause of waste is the attempt to get a Greek temple . . . with a $40,000 appropriation."

---

23 Simon Pepper, personal communication.
contemporaries, Watts had few assets apart from small land holdings within Leonard and his income as postmaster. His tiny, single room namesake built in 1911 is composed of rock-faced concrete blocks and features a roof of scalloped metal shingles and eaves trimmed with cut wood trim. Undisputedly the most modest subject in the state's inventory of libraries, this small building makes vestigial reference to the much earlier Stick style through the use of a decorative truss in the entry gable.

For the most part, North Dakota's privately endowed libraries are bold departures from the simple classicism of the state's Carnegies. The design of the James Memorial Library in Williston, however, displays the elegant conventions of Neoclassicism popular during the period. The product of Minot architect, R.S. Frost, the design provides a study in contrast with his other Neoclassical library, the Minot Carnegie. Elevated by a deep basement and preceded by a long stairway and high portico, the James is the more statuesque of the two. The interior program is especially rich, combining a decorative plaster cornice, pedimented doorway; and domed ceiling capped on the roof by a large, Georgian cupola. It was perhaps the freedom of a generous commission that enabled Frost to reach more stately proportions in this project.

Visually, the sharpest contrast between Carnegies and other private endowments is that the locally sponsored buildings offer a more varied palette of architectural themes. Few in number, they display mannerisms that either qualified with the best of contemporary period designs or escaped back into the picturesque whimsy of the Victorian era. Homogeneity, while not the rule for Carnegies in other states, prevails among the North Dakota subjects. The lack of experimental design among North Dakota Carnegies may suggest that the Corporation's direction was sought more often here than in other states. The recurrence of designs also points to a degree of reverence for and conformity to acclaimed prototypes and prevailing national tastes for Neoclassical design.

The esteemed model for library philanthropy, Andrew Carnegie was perhaps less interested in design aesthetics than in the need for practical buildings that served the public good. Ironically for Carnegie, his libraries are perhaps equally remembered for their rich architectural legacy as for their noble contribution to the cause of public library reform. The same may be said for the philanthropic library heritage of North Dakota. From the earliest example in the Mayville Public Library of 1900 to the Leach Memorial Library of 1923, functional necessity is coupled with assertive details and stylistic programs that engage, entertain and instruct the viewer. Today, Carnegies and other privately funded libraries are stewards of cultural and artistic values and provide visual lessons in architectural history within the state and across the nation. As landmarks that merged the subtleties of social history with the more overt gestures of the buildings arts, they reaffirm the democratic principles of public education and social reform that moved the first library philanthropists.

Lauren L. McCroskey, Architectural Historian for the State Historical Society of North Dakota, holds an M.S. degree in Historic Preservation from the University of Oregon (1988). This article is based on her National Register Nomination of "Philanthropically Established Libraries in North Dakota," completed in 1989.
The facade of the Alfred E. Dickey library, Jamestown, retains the classical format of a projecting entry and side bays of equal dimension. However, the symmetry and classicism is dressed with contemporary enrichments in the Prairie School style. One of North Dakota's finest examples of terra cotta ornamentation, the Dickey features an ornamental initial block, ribbons of stylized plant motifs and planters richly cast with foliate relief, complimented by a backdrop of wire-raked brick.